

**In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful.**

# **Qira'at Khalfal Imam**

**By Qazi Fazlullah**

In Islam, prayer is the much more important practice after "shahadah". This is the central pillar of Islam and the symbol of iman as well. It has its pre-requisites, its constituents, compulsory parts and recommended practices. In its constituents or "Arkan," one of them is the "Qiraat" (recitation). There is a difference of opinion amongst the jurists in this regard as under:

1. Recitation of Surah Fatiha is "Fard" (Mandatory), or of any part of the Quran?
2. Recitation is mandatory for everyone who prays, or for an imam, and the one who is praying on his own or for one who is praying behind an imam?

Imam Abu Hanifa said that "Fard" is to recite a considerable part of the Holy Quran, and a considerable part is one "Ayah" (verse), which gives a complete meaning and sense. Allah (SWT) has challenged those who refused this Holy Book to be the word of Allah, to make the like of only one "Ayah", as it is there in chapter 2 verse number 22, but his two students Imam Abu Yusuf and Imam Muhammad said, a considerable part is three small verses or one long verse.

According to Hanafites, the recitation of "Suratul Fatiha" is Wajib (Compulsory) but not Fard (Mandatory), because of the "Ahadith" we will quote later on Insha Allah.

Then, this recitation of a considerable part of the Holy Book is "Fard" for the Imam and the one who prays alone, and same is the case of "Suratul Fatiha" that its recitation is also "Wajib" for the Imam and the one who prays alone.

As for the case of one who prays behind an Imam there will be no recitation but to keep quiet. This status of the recitation of a considerable part of Quran being "Fard" and of "Suratul Fatiha" being "Wajib" is in the first two rakats of a three rakat Fard prayer, and of a four rakat Fard prayer. While in the last one or two rakat of the Fard prayer, respectively there is an option to keep quiet, to say Tasbeeh three times, or to recite Suratul Fatiha (Narrated from Aisha and Ibn Masud). While this recitation of a considerable part and Suratul Fatiha having the same status in all three rakats of Witr, in both rakats of Fajr Prayer, two rakats of Juma Prayer, Eid Prayer, and in all four rakats of Sunnah and Nafl Prayer, as in Sunnah and Nafl prayer each two rakats are considered as a complete unit of prayer.

The recitation of Suratul Fatiha and recitation of another considerable part of Holy Quran joined to Al Fatiha is wajib i.e. both are wajib. Imam Malik says that recitation of Fatiha and another part of the book is Fard for the Imam and the one who prays alone, while the one who prays behind the Imam the recitation of Fatiha is recommended in a prayer where the Imam recites silently but not in a prayer where the Imam recites loudly. His "Mazhab" is that only the recitation of Fatiha is Fard and not that of another part, which is Sunnah. He has another saying like Imam Abu Hanifa as well. Imam Shafi said that recitation of Suratul Fatiha is Fard for everyone who prays, i.e. the Imam, the one who is behind him, and the one who prays alone, and this is in each and every rakat of every prayer. Imam Ahmad has one saying like that of Imam Shafi and one like that of Imam Malik that Fatiha is Fard to be recited by the Imam and the

one who prays alone, while for one behind an Imam it is recommended in a prayer where the Imam recites silently but not where he recites loudly. According to Imam Malik, recitation of Fatiha is Fard in three out of four rakats, and to join another part of the Holy Quran to Fatiha is Sunnah according to Malik, Shafi and Ahmad. Imam Abu Hanifa said that Allah says; "So recite whatever is easy out of Quran" 73:20. It means that reciting a part of Quran is Fard and not that of Fatiha. The Prophet of Allah when he corrected the prayer of Khallad Ibni Rafi to make his wudu perfect and recite whatever is easy from the Quran (Bukhari and Muslim). Those who say that recitation of Fatiha is Fard they refer to various sayings such as:

1. Hadith of Obadah Ibni Samit that the Prophet said " There is no prayer for one who did not recite Al Fatiha"
2. Ibni Khazaimah and Ibni Hibban both related that the Prophet said, "That prayer does not suffice where the Fatiha is not recited. Imam Shafi said that the word "La" for negation means no prayer, also this word negates the nature and essence of the prayer of everyone as he used the word "Man" i.e. relative pronoun which means, whosoever, whether it is the Imam, one praying behind the Imam, or alone.
3. Abu Dawud and Tirmizi narrated from Obadah that we were behind the Prophet in Fajr prayer and he recited but recitation became difficult for him, so when he completed he asked if we were reciting behind our Imam, we said yes. He said do not do this but only Fatiha, as there is no prayer for one who did not recite it. In a

riwayat by Abu Dawud he said do not recite anything from Quran when I recite loudly but only "Ummul Quran" (Fatiha)

4. Ibni Abi Shaibah narrated from Abu Qilabah that the Messenger of Allah said to his companions, do you recite behind your Imam? Some of them said yes and some others said no. He said if you want to do so you may recite Fatiha in your heart.
5. Abu Hurairah said when the Messenger of Allah turned around from the prayer he recited loudly therein so he said did anyone recite with me now. One person said yes, he said I was thinking why I have been countering the recitation. He says so people stopped recitation with the Prophet when he was reciting loudly. (Ahmad, Malik, Abu Dawud, Tirmizi, Nasai, Ibni Majah)

So they said it means that recitation of Fatiha is Fard and everyone may recite it even the one behind the Imam. Abu Hanifa said that Allah said, "And when the Quran is recited then listen to it and keep quiet so you may have the mercy." (7:204)

Hafiz Ibni Kathir related the sayings of Sahaba that this verse is regarding "khutbah and prayer both. He also related the sayings of "Tabieen" who related from Sahabah like Ibni Masud, Ibni Abbas, and Abu Hurairah. From Tabieen there is Ibni Jubair, Hasan Basri, Sha'bi, Ibrahim, Zuhari, Mujahid, Qatadah and Ata. Hafiz Ibni Taimiyah said in "Fatawa" that the scholars of the past said this is regarding recitation in prayer and some others said this is regarding Khutbah. Imam Ahmad

said there is "Ijma"(consensus) to this saying. Ibni Qudamah relates from Ahmad this Ijma (Al Mughni). He added from Ahmad that we never heard anyone who said when the Imam recites loudly so the prayer of one behind him is void if he did not recite as well. This is the Prophet and these are his Sahabah and Tabieen. Malik in Hijaz, Thawri in Iraq, Auzai in Sham, and Laith in Misr never said to one who did not recite behind the Imam that your prayer is void. In Sharhul Muqannah volume #2, it is said "and recitation is not binding on one behind the Imam, and this is the saying of the majority of scholars". From amongst them are; Ibni Abbas, Ibni Masud, Abu Sayeed Al Khudri, Zaid Ibni Thabit, Uqbah Ibni Aamir, Jabir, Ibni Umar, and Hudhaifah Ibnul Yaman from Sahaba. Thawri, Ibni Uyainah, Malik, Zuhari, Aswad, Ibrahim and Ibni Jubair, while Ibni Sireen said, "I do not know if recitation behind Imam is from Sunnah." Abu Hanifa also referred to Ahadith.

1. Imam Muslim narrated from Abu Musa that the Prophet said when you pray make your lines straight, then one of you may lead the prayer, and when the Imam says takbeer then say takbeer. Imam Muslim related in this hadith that the Prophet said, "And when the Imam recites then keep quiet and when he says "walad daalleen," say Amin. Abu Ishaq says that Abu Bakr the nephew of Imam Muslim asked his uncle about this last added words in the riwayat of Sulaiman at Taimi, so he said you are looking for someone stronger than Sulaiman, and then Abu Bakr asked him about the riwayat Abu Hurairah, so Muslim said that is okay. Abu Bakr said but you

did not put it in your book, he said I put only those Aahadith the Muhadditheen agreed upon its authenticity. It means that these added words are authentic and he authenticated the same like words in the riwayat of Abu Hurairah narrated by Abu Dawud, Ahmad and Nisai. Yes, Abu Dawood said regarding this adding in the riwayat of Abu Musa that this is by Sulaiman only, and he also said about this in the hadith of Abu Hurairah that this is a "wahm" (own thinking) of Abu Khalid al Ahmar. We say that Nisai, Ibn Majah, Ibn Abi Shaibah, Ahmad, and Dari Qutni also narrated this and there are answers to what is said about the tafarrud of Abu Khalid and Sulaiman. We say that Sulaiman is authenticated by Muslim, Ahmad, Nisai, Dhahabi, Ajali, Ibni Hiban and Yahya Ibni Maeen. Abu Khalid is authenticated by Yahya, Ibnul Madeeni, Wakee, Ajali, Ibni Hisham ar Rifai and Abu Hatim.

2. It is a known rule that tafarrud is not considerable if there is any contradicting riwayat from a more authentic rawi, while there is no such like riwayat which says, "And when the Imam recites you may recite also." Also we say that there is no tafarrud in this riwayat of Abu Musa as Abu Awaneh related the same from Abu Ubaidah, from Qatadah, and Dari Qutni who related this from Umar Ibni Aaamir and Saeed Ibni Abu Aroobah, who related from Qatadah, and the riwayat of Abu Hurairah, as Nisai narrated the same from Muhammad Ibni Dad al Ansari, who said the same like words from the same teacher.

3. Baihaqi relates from Anas that the Prophet said when the Imam recites then keep quiet.
4. The riwayat of Abu Hurairah, which we have quoted already when the Prophet asked if someone has recited and one person said yes, and then they stopped reciting when the Prophet used to recite loudly. (Malik, Ahmad)
5. Baihaqi narrated from Umar that someone recited behind the Prophet in "Dhur" prayer and the Prophet asked about it, he said yes I recited "Sabbihisma Rabbika". The Prophet said if the recitation of the Imam does not suffice, indeed Imam is appointed to be followed so when he recites then keep quiet. Imam Baihaqi said regarding these two riwayat that at least these are the support to the riwayat of Abu Musa and Abu Hurairah.
6. Tahawi related from Ibni Masud that they used to recite behind the Prophet so he said you mixed me up in recitation.
7. Abdullah Ibni Shaddad relates from Jabir that the Messenger of Allah said, "Whoever has an Imam for him then the recitation of the Imam is his recitation." (Musnad of Ahmad Ibni Manee, Muatta of Muhammad) This hadith is saheeh to the level of Bukhari and Muslim.
8. Jabir said one man was reciting behind the Prophet in Dhur or Asr, another person indicated towards him not to recite, when the prayer was done he said you stopped me to recite behind the Prophet. The Prophet heard them so he said whoever

prayed behind the Imam then the recitation of the Imam is his recitation.(Baihaqi, Muatta of Muhammad).

9. Imam Ahmad related from Abdullah Ibni Buhainah that someone recited behind the Prophet and he asked about it after the prayer and then the people thereafter stopped reciting with him.

Abu Hanifa says that the "Aayat" which says, "Recite whatever is easy out of the Quran," are "Qat'l" (certain and mutawatir), and in the riwayat of Obadah narrated by Bukhari and Muslim, and the riwayat in the books of Ibni Hibban and Ibni Khuzaimah both are "Khabarul Wahid" (uncertain and dhanni). So it can neither abrogate the "Aayat" nor can it add anything to it. In addition, we say about these Ahadith that the negation is not the negation of the very nature of the prayer but of its perfection like the one in the Hadith of Jabir and Abu Hurairah that the Prophet said, "There is no prayer for the neighbor of the Masjid but in the Masjid" (Dari Qutni). No one said that if the same person prayed at home then his prayer is void, but at most they say his prayer is not perfect as for the reward is concerned. This is the like of another Hadith narrated by Ibni Abi Hatam and Ibni Jareer that the Prophet said, "There is no prayer for the one who did not obey the prayer, and obedience to prayer is to stop from immorality and wrong doings." Now if someone prays but does not refrain from immorality and wrongdoing no one can say that his prayer is void but at most, he can say that the perfection to his prayer is to abstain

from wrong doings and immorality. This interpretation could be supported by a Hadith narrated by Muslim that the Messenger of Allah said, "There is no prayer for one who did not recite "Ummul Quran" (Suratul Fatiha) and another Surah." Here the mandatory is recitation in general and Suratul Fatiha is a part of it. Suratul Fatiha and something else alone could not be mandatory but less in status, and this is why Abu Hanifa said that to recite Suratul Fatiha is wajib as well as other verses from the Quran which is also Wajib. Also Imam Muslim narrated from Abu Hurairah that the Messenger of Allah said one who did not recite "Ummul Kitab" (Suratul Fatiha) in prayer, that prayer is "Khidaj, Khidaj, Khidaj" (He said it three times, meaning incomplete). Now we say that the riwayat of Obadah, Ibni Khuzaimah, and Ibni Hiban may be conditioned by all these other riwayat, so it means that the two riwayat are applied to Imam and to someone who prays alone, and also to the level of "Wajib" and not "Fard," while the lengthy riwayat of Obadah is not "Saheeh" even though Dari Qutni, Khatabi and Baihaqi tried to elevate it to the level of Saheeh. And let's say it is "Saheeh," but still it does not qualify what they say regarding "Suratul Fatiha" that it is "Fard" for everyone because the way the Prophet asked his Sahabah, "Maybe you are reciting behind your Imam?" which means this was not a known practice, and in the Hadith of Abu Qilabah he asked "Do you recite behind your Imam?" and some said yes while some others said no, and the Prophet said if you want to recite then recite "Suratul Fatiha" only. Also in the Hadith of Abu Hurairah the Prophet asked, "Did anyone recite with me now?" this also means that this was not the practice. The Ahadith of Abu Hurairah and Abu Musa are clear in

this regard that when the Imam recites then keep quiet. This rule applies generally to a prayer whether the Imam recites loudly or silently. Because the Prophet said to also keep quiet in Salatul Dhuhur as mentioned before in the Hadith narrated by Umar and the riwayat of Jabir where it mentions explicitly and clearly that someone was reciting behind the Prophet in Dhuhur or Asr, and the Prophet said, "Whoever prayed behind Imam then the recitation of Imam is his recitation." Regarding the riwayat of Muslim where the Prophet said "Fatiha" as well as something else," they said that "something else" is the "Tafarrud" of Mamar. We say that he is the most authentic student of Zuhari as Ibn Maeen said. Also, Ibnul Madeeni and Abu Hatam authenticated him, and Imam Bukhari in "Jazul Qiraat" narrated this from Ibni Ishaq even though Bukhari rejected this "Mutaba'at and said we do not know this, so we say if Bukhari would have found it with a proper chain he would have accepted it. There is the proper chain as Abu Dawud related the same from Sufyan, from Zuhari, and there are "Mutaba'aat" from Auza'i, Shuaib Ibni Hamzah, Salih Ibni Keesan and Abdur Rahman Ibni Ishaq al Madani. In addition, Abu Dawud narrated from Abu Saeed that we were ordered to recite "Fatihatul Kitab," and whatever else, which are easy, and he narrated from Abu Hurairah that the Prophet ordered me to announce that there is no prayer but with "Fatiha" and some extra, while Tirmizi related "Fatiha" and another "Surah" with it. One narrator of the Hadith of Obadah, Sufyan was of the view that recitation is for one who prays alone and the teacher of Sufyan, Imam Zuhari liked recitation for one behind an Imam only in a prayer where he recites silently. Mahmood Ibni Rabee was the son of Obadah's sister and his

son in law as well, and he was from the Junior Sahabah. He says, I asked Obadah, "Do you recite behind the Imam"? He said "There is no prayer but with recitation." This question and answer implicates that this recitation was not a known practice, otherwise Obadah would have said and would have shown his anger to his son in law as he had this temper. In one issue, he even became angry with Muawiyah and left Sham. He came back to Madinah and said that he will not stay there under the governorship of Muawiyah, so Umar sent him back to teach there and he will not be subject to Muawiyah. What Baihaqi said that the Prophet disliked their loud recitation, so we say then he should have said, you people recite very loud. He said "Maybe you recite." Yes, how the Prophet knew it if they were reciting silently? We say this was a miracle. Ahmad and Baihaqi narrated that the Prophet came out and Abu Bakr was leading, so he started recitation where at Abu Bakr reached. It means that the recitation of Imam was considered. Regarding the recitation of the one who is behind the Imam. Allama Aalosi relates from Shabi that I met 70 Badri Sahabah, they use to prevent from recitation behind Imam. Now a well-known rule in science of Hadith is that when there is such like contradiction then we may look at Ta'amul of Sahabah (practice of Sahabah), i.e. Imam Muslim narrated:

1. Zaid Ibni Thabit said, "There is no recitation with the Imam in any thing (Prayer).

2. Malik narrated from Nafi that whenever Ibni Umar was asked, he said when you are behind the Imam then his recitation "Qiraat" is enough and when you pray alone then recite, and he himself used not to recite (Muatta).
3. Wahab Ibn Keesan says Jabir Ibni Abdullah said, "Whoever prayed a rakat and did not recite therein "Fatihatul Kitab" he has not prayed but if he is behind an Imam," (Tirmizi, Tahawi, Muatta).
4. Ibni Masud said keep quiet during recitation because the Imam will suffice you. (Muatta of Mohammad)
5. Zaid Ibni Aslam said the Prophet prohibited recitation behind Imam and our teachers told us that Ali said whoever recited behind the Imam then there is no prayer for him. (Musanaf Abdur Razaq)
6. Musa Ibni Oqbah said that the Prophet, Abu Bakr, and Uthman used to prohibit recitation behind Imam.(Abdur Razaq)
7. Zaid Ibni Aslam said Ibni Umar would prohibit from recitation behind the Imam. (Abdur Razaq)
8. Mohammad Ibni Ajlan narrated from Ali that he said, "Whoever recited with the Imam, then he is not on nature (natural way). (Dari Qutni)

9. Ibn Masud said, "The one who recites with the Imam his mouth should be filled up with dust," and Umar said, "I wish for one who recites behind the Imam that in his mouth is stone." (Muatta of Mohammad)
10. Saad Ibn Abi Waqqas said, "I wish a burning coal in the mouth of one who recites behind the Imam." (Mohammad)
11. Zaid Ibn Thabit said, "The one who recites behind the Imam there is no prayer for him." (Abdur Razaq)
12. Abu Jamrah asked Ibn Abbas, should I recite while the Imam is in front of me? He said no. (Tahawi, Al Joharun Naqi, Aatharus Sunan)
13. Katheer Ibn Murrah related from Abu Darda that someone asked the Prophet "Is there a recitation in every prayer?" He said yes, so someone said is that compulsory, Abu Darda said, "O Katheer, and I was to his side, I do not think when Imam is leading but he suffices them." (Dari Qutni)

Zaid Ibn Habbab narrated this from Muawiyah Ibn Saleh with this chain and he said therein that the Prophet said "I did not see." So he did a mistake therein as these are the words of Abu Darda even though Tabrani narrated this as "Marfoo" (attributed to the Prophet). Haitham said that this is "Hasan" (a type of Maqbool Hadith).

Now we will give the "Aathar" (sayings and practices) of "Tabieen" as follows:

1. Ibrahim said Alqamah never recited in "Jahri" prayer (where Imam recites loudly) or in "Sirri" (where Imam recites silently) and not in the last two rakats of a prayer which consist of four rakat, neither "Fatiha" nor anything else behind the Imam.  
(Kitabul Aaathar)
2. Ibrahim says that Alqamah said to bite a tree is liked to me than reciting behind Imam. (Muatta of Mohammad)
3. Abu Is'haq relates that Alqamah said the one who recites behind Imam his mouth is filled up, he said I think he meant with dust or with pebbles. This is Alqamah the long time student of Ibni Masud, and he passed away in 68 AH.
4. Abu Ishaq says the companions of Ibni Masud used not to recite behind the Imam. (These two riwayat are from Musannaf of Abdur Razaq).
5. The same like practice is narrated by Malik Ibni Aamir and he mentioned from amongst them were Amr Ibni Maimun, the student of Ibni Masud, and he passed in 74AH. (Ibni Abi Shaibah)
6. Ibrahim narrated from Aswad Ibni Yazeed to bite a live coal is liked to me than reciting behind the Imam. (Ibni Abi Shaibah)
7. Waleed Ibni Qais asked Suwaid Ibni Ghafalah should I recite in Dhuhr and Asr behind the Imam? He said no. (Ibni Abi Shaibah)

8. Abu Bisher asked Saeed Ibni Jubair and he said, "There is no qira'at behind the Imam. (Aatharus Sunan)
9. Ibni Abi Shaibah narrated from Ibnul Musayyib "keep quiet for the Imam."
10. Ibrahim would dislike recitation behind Imam as Ibni Abi Shaibah related from Mugheerah.
11. Ibni Sirin said, "I do not know if recitation behind the Imam is Sunnah." (Ibni Abi Shaibah)

Yes, Orwah Ibni Zubair used to recite behind the Imam where he was reciting silently (Muatta). Salim Ibni Abdullah said, "Recitation of Imam suffices you where he recites loudly." (Abdur Razaq). Imam Zuhari said "When the Imam recites loudly then do not recite anything."

Tasmiyah, Ta'awwudh, Tahmeed and Tameen:

1. There is another issue, which is of Tasmiyah (saying Bismillahir Rahmanir Rahim).  
Is it an ayah of the Quran or from every Surah?

Ibni Abbas, Ibni Umar, Ibni Zubair, Ali and Abu Hurairah from Sahabah, Makhool, Ata, Tawoos, Ibni Jubair, Ibnul Mubarak from Tabieen, and Imam Shafi and Ahmad as well said that this is an ayah from every Surah in the beginning except "Suratul Taubah" as the Prophet never recited this before this Surah. Shafi and Ahmad referred to a Hadith Bukhari narrated in Al Adabul Mufrad that the Prophet counted Suratul Fatiha's seven verses and counted Tasmiyah as one verse. The same like Ibni Khuzaimah related from Ummi Salamah, but from that Hadith it is known that Tasmiyah was considered a part of the first ayah. Sahabah used not to put anything in Quran, which is not from Quran, but still they used to put Tasmiyah therein, which means it is from Quran. Imam Abu Hanifa and Imam Malik say Tasmiyah is neither an ayah from Fatiha nor an ayah from another Surah, but as it is mostly used therein when the Prophet was beginning a Surah, so that is why it may be recited in Khatmul Quran once anywhere in the beginning of one Surah, except starting Surah At Taubah. Ibni Abbas said "The Prophet used not to know the distinction of a Surah from another one but only when Tasmiyah was recited to him by Angel Jibreel." (Abu Dawud). In addition, Anas said, "I prayed behind the Prophet, Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman and they would start recitation with Alhamdu lillahi..." (Bukhari, Muslim). Aisha said, "The Prophet would start the prayer with Takbeer and Qira'at with Alhamdu lillahi..." If Tasmiyah was a part of Fatiha then for sure they would have recited it the way they were reciting the rest of the Fatiha. Imam Shafi said it may be recited before Fatiha the way he recites Fatiha, and even after Fatiha when he is going to join another Surah or Ayah to it. This is attributed to

Saeed, Ikramah, Zuhari and Makhool. Hakim and Nasa'i narrated that Abu Hurairah recited it loudly and said my prayer is more like that of the Prophet. We say yes, the Prophet did it to teach them that he recites it and its recitation before Fatiha is Sunnah, but Malik has taken the Hadith of Anas literally so he does not recite anything before Fatiha. Hakim narrated from Ibni Abbas that the Prophet would recite the Tasmiyah loudly. We say yes, that was to teach them and that is why Abu Hanifa said one who prays alone may recite it silently before Fatiha in every prayer, but the Imam should not recite it in the second rakat where he recites loudly so there may not be something silent in between two louds. Ibni Abi Shaibah said from Ibrahim that Ibni Masud said four things are there the Imam has to say it silently, Ta'awwudh, Tasmiyah, Ta meen and Tahmeed.

2. Before Tasmiyah in the first rakat, Ta'awwudh should be recited (saying, "A'udhu Billahi...."), as it is Sunnah. Allah Tala says, "So when you recite the Quran then seek protection of Allah from Satan the rejected one." (An Nah'l:98)
  
3. Before Ta'awwudh and Tasmiyah in the first rakat everyone has to recite Thanā (Subhanak Allahuma Wa bihamdika Wa Tabarakasmuka Wa Ta'ala Jadduka Wa La ilaha Ghairuk), as Abu Dawud narrated from Aisha and Dari Qutni from Anas, and in Sunan that is narrated from Abu Saeed Khudri. Imam Muslim said that Umar

recited it loudly. It may be for educational purposes otherwise Umar said four things may be recited silently, Ta'awwudh, Tasmiyah, Ta meen and Tahmeed. In "Jamul Jawami" Imam Suyuti also related from Abu Wa'il that Umar and Ali would not recite Ta'awwudh, Tasmiyah and Ta meen loudly. Abu Jareer, Tahawi, Ibni Shaheeh, Ahmad, Abu Yala, Tabrani, Dari Qutni and Hakim narrated from Alqamah from Abu Dawud and Tirmizi narrated from Sufyan from Abu Wa'il loudly. Both of these Ahadith have some defects therein. Now, only the Hadith of Ibni Masud remains without defect. Shafites say, after Tahreemah one has to recite "Inni wajjahtu wajhiya lilladhi fataras samaawati wal ardi haneefaw wa ma ana minal mushrikeen. Inna salati wa nusuki wa mahyaya wa mamati lilahi Rabbil Aalamin la shareeka lahu wa bi dhalika umirtu wa ana minal Muslimeen," as narrated by Ahmad, Muslim, Tirmizi from Ali. Then what Abu Hanifa said is called "Thana," and what Shafi said is called "Tawajjuh". In nafl Abu Hanifa allowed both. In addition, Ahmad allowed certain other "Thanas" as well. Shafi said that one who joined the Imam after the Imam already started Fatiha then the one behind should recite "Tawajjuh," however according to Hanafites and Hanbalites after that the Imam started "Fatiha" it is not allowed. Ta'awwudh and Tasmiyah both are for "Qiraat" according to Abu Hanifa so the one behind Imam should not recite it. Ahmad said that these are like "Tawajjuh" and "Thana," so the one behind should also recite it. Abu Yusuf also narrates this.

4. "Ta meem" (saying Aameen). Regarding "Aameen" one who recited Fatiha should say it and the one behind him should say it as well. According to Shafi and Ahmad

the Imam and Muqtadi (follower) both should say it loudly in Jahri (audible) prayers, as all Muhadditheen related that the Prophet said when the Imam says Aameen you may say Ta meem as well, and whose Aameen coincided with the Aameen of the Imam his sins are forgiven. Imam Bukhari wrote two chapters in this regard.

- i. Imam says Aameen loudly.
- ii. Muqtadi says Aameen loudly. In both chapters, he related the Hadith of Abu Hurairah, however, in the first chapter the wording is “and when the Imam says Aameen so you may say Aameen.” Ibni Shahab said “and the Messenger of Allah used to say Aameen,” while in the second chapter the wording is “when the Imam says Walad daalleen then say Aameen.” Based on this Hadith, Imam Bukhari, Shafi and Ahmad are of the view that Aameen should be recited loudly. Imam Abu Hanifa and Malik referred to the Hadith of Hajar Ibnul Anbas from Alqamah Ibni Wa’il from his father who says I prayed with the Prophet and when he recited Walad daalleen he said Aameen and made is voice secret within. Hakim related the same, and said the word as “and lowered his voice with it”. Now all the narrators of this Hadith are authentic but Bukhari and Muslim did not bring this Hadith, as there is a difference in the words of Shobah and Thawri. However, Tirmizi relates from his Sheikh Imam Bukhari that he said that Shobah made three mistakes in this riwayat, two in its chain and one in its text. Regarding the chain he mentioned:

- 1) Hajar Abul Anbas while he Hajar Ibnul Anbas.
- 2) He added the name of Alqamah Ibni Wa'il, while Hajar Ibnul Anbas himself relates from Wa'il directly where in the text he said, "He lowered, made secret his voice," while the correct words are "And he stretched his voice with it". In addition, Tirmizi relates from Bukhari that Alqamah was born six months after the death of his father Wa'il, so he never took Riwayat from his father. However, Imam Tirmizi rejected this objection and said, "And Alqamah heard from his father who is older than his brother Abdul Jabbar, their mother is one and the same and she is the mother of Yahya as well, and they both were not twins, and Abdul Jabbar did not hear from his father." Also in Saheeh Muslim, Nisa'l, and in Juz Rafil Yadain of Bukhari, there are Riwayaat which express that Alqamah heard from his father. As far as the first three objections are concerned, we say that Hajar Ibnul Anbas is Abul Anbas as well. Allamah Aini relates from Ibni Hibban that his "Kunya" i.e. nickname is like the name of his father, so he said in "Kitabul Thuqat," Hajar Ibnul Anbas Abus Sakan al Kufi is the same person who is called Abul Anbas. Thauri narrated from him and mentioned him as Hajar Ibnul Anbas as this is in Abu Dawud. Dari Qutni related it in chapter of "Taameem" from Sufyan Thauri from Salamah Ibni Kuhail from Hajar Abi Anbas that he is Ibni Anbas. Hijr said, "I heard this Hadith from Alqamah from his father and also directly from his father as it is in "Musnadi Ahmad" and

“Musnad Abi Dawud at Tayalisi,” so this is an adding of an authentic one and that is “Maqbool” and this is called “Almazeed fi Muttasilil Asaneed,” and what Bukhari said regarding the text that Shobah said “he made secret/slow or lowered his voice,” while Sufyan said “stretched his voice,” and Shobah himself said that Sufyan is more authentic than him. Yahya Ibn Saeed Al Qattan said, no one is more liked to me than Shoba, but when Sufyan says other than what Shobah said then I take Sufyan’s words. Tirmizi said from Abu Zurrah that the Riwayah of Sufyan is more authentic in this regard, however we say that Tirmizi in “Kitabul ilal” related from Sufyan that Shobah is “Amirul Mu’mineen Fil Hadith”. He also related from Yahya Ibn Saeed Al Qattan when he was asked about both of them, he said that Shobah is more authentic and he is more knowledgeable in narrators, while Sufyan is “Sahibul Abwab” (knowledgeable in “Fiqh), and that is what Yahya meant by him preferring Sufyan over Shobah. In “At Tahzeeb” there are comments of the scholars regarding Shobah that he is more authentic than Sufyan and there is none in the world more better in Hadith than Shobah. Yahya said I prefer Sufyan and he himself would say Aameen secretly. A patch up between these two are possible as Wa’il Ibn Hujr came to the Prophet a few times so he may have seen him saying Aameen loudly once and secretly another occasion. Tabari said both Ahadith are ok but most Sahabah and Tabieen used to say Aameen secretly. Regarding the loud Aameen it was for educational purposes as

Umar said, "Tahmeed" i.e. "Thana" were done loudly as we mentioned before for educational reasons as Hafiz Abdul Bashir Ad Dolabi said in "Alalma walkuna." Then stretching the voice and saying it secretly both have no contradiction as Abdul Jabbar said that my father Wa'il said I heard it, as I was right behind him. Abu Dawud related from Abu Hurairah that one who was near him in the first row would hear it. The "Athar" of Ibnu Zubair that he and others would say it loudly because the masjid had an echo, so we say that this is not a matter of permissibility rather a matter of merit. Perhaps Ibnu Zubair and his followers were saying Aameen in "Qunut Nazilah" when he declared his khalafat in Makkah and Abdul Malik's forces were proceeding towards Makkah, however he was from the junior Sahabah and the senior Sahabah would not say it loudly as we mentioned previously. Regarding what Abu Hurairah said to the Imam that do not put me to a test regarding Aameen was regarding when he was appointed as Muaddhin in Bahrain by Marwan and the Imam would pray in a hurried state, so he asked him not to be in such a hurry because he would miss the Aameen. The Imam in Bahrain was Ala Al Hadrami who would pray in a hurried state. It is not known whether Abu Hurairah was saying Aameen loudly or silently. From the Riwayah "when the Imam says Aameen so you may say Aameen as well," they say it means loudly as Imam says it. The same Riwayah in one way is when the Imam says "Walad daaleen," say Aameen which indicates that the Imam does not say Aameen even silently.

Nisa'i narrated it that the Imam says it and that made it clear that he says it silently because if it was loud then there was no need to mention as it is heard. If the Hadith means that the muqtadi (followers) say it loud so the Imam should say it. Regarding this we say in a Hadith it is said when the Imam says Sami Allahu Liman Hamida then say Rabbana Lakal Hamd, however the Imam does not say Rabbana Lakal Hamd loudly, also saying it does not mean it has to be out loud as the Sahabah asked the Prophet that we know how to say salam to you but how do we say salat on you, so the Prophet said say Allahumma Salli Ala Muhammadin. This does not mean to say it loud. Imam Malik said there is no Aameen for the Imam. In addition, if Aameen loudly was the practice then it would have been related by hundreds and thousands of Sahabah. We only find the Athar of Ibni Zubair in this regard. In addition, we pose a question to those who say Aameen should be with a loud voice that you also say that Fatiha has to be recited also, so when will you recite it? Samurah Ibni Jundub related two pauses from the Prophet, one after Tahreemah and another after Fatiha. Ubai Ibni Kab said this is true, but Imran Ibni Husain said only the first one, which means the second one was that short that he did not feel it even though that was for Aameen which was said silently. If the muqtadi (followers) also recites Aameen will he say it after the Fatiha of the Imam or after his own Fatiha. If he says it after the Fatiha of the Imam then what happens after his own Fatiha, and if he says it after his own Fatiha then

what happens after the Fatiha of the Imam. If the Imam had said Aameen after his own Fatiha then the Aameen of the muqtadi, if he says it after his own Fatiha then it does not coincide the Aameen of the Imam, and if the Imam is waiting until muqtadi finishes his Fatiha and says Aameen then he will say it as well. We ask that the muqtadi recites Fatiha silently and will say Aameen loudly. This will not make sense. If he also says Aameen silently then how will the Imam come to know when to join him in Aameen. He will be standing for a long time for no reason, which also does not make sense.